



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

the temporal clause. A full understanding, however, of this question will not be gained until an examination, covering a representative field, is made of the relative usage in simple and compound forms for the same author. Then we may trace those movements which point to a growing, less dependent element in the pluperfect, and shall doubtless find that the difference of meaning is not confined to the temporal clause, but is a widespread fact in tense development.

GUSTAV G. LAUBSCHER.

*Randolph-Macon Woman's College.*

---

SIR PHILIP SIDNEY, *The Countess of Pembroke's Arcadia*. Edited by ALBERT FEULLERAT. Cambridge: at the University Press. 1912. xx, 572 pp. 8°

This attractive first volume augurs well for M. Feullerat's projected complete works of Sidney, and suggests once more the many *lacunae* in scholarly works on Elizabethan non-dramatic literature. In reprinting as a unit the 1590 quarto text without deviation, that is, Sidney's incomplete revision of his earlier work with chapter divisions and lyrics as arranged by "the over-seer of the print" (p. 4), the editor provides by notes and appendix means of reconstructing the 1593 version edited by Sidney's sister. Not only this, but he has noted also all verbal variants found in the fourteen folio editions of *Arcadia* up to 1624; he provides a list of misprints in the quarto—both those corrected by him and those left standing; and he has added a facsimile title-page, an Alphabetical Table of the Personages in *Arcadia*, and an Index of First Lines of Poems. The volume is an important, serviceable, and sound contribution to Elizabethan scholarship.

Many, perhaps, will regard as supererogatory the collation of most of the folios, which, the editor informs us (p. x), delayed the publication for two years. Though this serve to settle "bibliographical problems," it affects negligibly our understanding of the text and of

the literary influence of the work. Meantime, the editor has completely passed over without collation "the old *Arcadia*"—Sidney's first version—which is extant in the three manuscripts discovered by Mr. Dobell. Collation of these would have revealed Sidney's taste in revision, and afforded means of determining whether a given author was influenced by the earlier or later version. The editor objects (p. ix n.) that "to include their variants would have meant practically printing the whole of the earlier form." Grant this: the important differences and similarities should have been indicated, especially where they affect personal allusions.

Take, for instance, the allusions to Sidney, to Stella, and to Sidney's sister. Philisides is represented (in heavy capitals on page 285) as being in love with a lady, "the *Star*, whereby his course was only directed." The appearance or non-appearance of this allusion in the earlier version affects potently our knowledge of the date of Sidney's addresses to Stella. So far as we can determine from the table of personages, this is the sole allusion to Sidney in *Arcadia*, since no registry is made of the melancholy shepherd (pp. 132, 352), who twice distinguished himself in song. This shepherd the 1593 edition (p. 565, l. 5) names Philisides. Nor can we deem it an error of Sidney's sister; for the first lyric contains (p. 133) an extended reminiscence of fellowship with Sidney's friend "Lanquet, the shepheard best swift Ister knewe." Moreover, the knight Philisides appears attended by shepherds and bearing for impress "a sheepe marked with pitch."

Similar allusions, as to Philisides' quarrel with Geron (p. 37) and friendship with Coridon (p. 135) and Helius (p. 285) ramify into a mesh of personal allegory in *Arcadia*, inviting research. But to determine Sidney's earlier and final intentions, as well as the contributions of his sister and the 1590 edition, requires just that collation of the manuscript which M. Feullerat neglected in favor of solving "bibliographical problems." Note, again, the allusions to Strephon and Claius (pp. 140, 348), lovers of Urania, which fail to appear in the Table of Personages. Who Urania was,

we know from Spenser's line (*Colin Clout*),  
 "Urania, sister unto Astrofell."

In "The Countesse of Pembrokes Arcadia" we cannot fail to wish to understand allusions to herself and to her lovers. The Countess in 1593 expanded one of these allusions (p. 564), giving herself the end of the first book. Was she here restoring or innovating?

It is to be hoped that M. Feuillerat, in an ensuing volume, will make complete this highly desirable and well begun first edition of the entire works of Sidney.

PERCY W. LONG.

Harvard University.

---

*The Gøngu-Hrólfssaga.* A Study in Old Norse Philology. By JACOB WITTMER HARTMANN. (Columbia University Dissertation. 1912.) 116 p.

It is to be stated with regret that this treatise does not add much to our knowledge of this entertaining and fantastic Fornaldarsaga. For one thing, the weight of the investigation is placed altogether on the wrong side—the historic-geographic,—whereas it is perfectly evident that it ought to have been laid on folklore and legendary traits. Excepting a short paragraph on the 'life-grass' in chapter IV (Sources and Materials of the *Gøngu-Hrólfssaga*), no study whatever is made of the rather numerous fairy-story motives present. Instead, the author goes on a wild-geese chase after possible geographic information in a Fornaldarsaga! Just as futile and aside of the point is the chapter on *Gøngu-Hrólf* as an Historical Character: who that is acquainted with this *lygisaga* of *lygisagas* believes for a moment that there is more than the name in common between its hero and the historic character?

In other respects also the work is unsatisfactory. In chapter II (Manuscripts of the *Gøngu-Hrólfssaga*) one looks for information on the redactions, merit, and relationship of the

various mss., but gets only a catalog of mss. containing the saga.

Furthermore, there are a number of important points about which there can be no two opinions. It is hard to see how the author could fail to note that the hero is but a slight variation from the favorite type of the fairy-story, the *kólbitr* (male Cinderella) who is by no means 'surly' (p. 37) but a good-natured, long-suffering, generous fellow who keeps his own counsel and wins in the end against the greatest odds by his sheer luck, resourcefulness, and strength. The statement that "throughout *GHS* the practice of sorcery is represented as common and apparently legitimate" (p. 38) is not warranted. On the contrary, here as in all saga literature it is practiced by persons who do not have a claim on our sympathy. Most Fornaldarsagas, just as most fairy-stories, even those gathered in recent times, take no notice whatever of Christianity. This is by no means an "intentional omission" as the author thinks (p. 33), in order to place the story in prehistoric times. It only proves that it was composed in times when Christianity was so much a matter of course that the story teller does not bother to point out that its supernatural occurrences happen in a different sphere—no more than does the fairy-story. The author wonders at the absence of 'the element of constant epithet' in 'this' saga, without realizing that the saga literature in general does not favor its use. The statement that the practice of *skera upp herqr* (the sending around of the war-arrow) is a commonplace in Fornaldarsaga literature (p. 42) does not betray very extensive reading in the sagas.

Appended to the treatise are 1, a part of one version of the *Gøngu-Hrólfss rimur*—on whose exceedingly slight merit I am entirely at one with the author; 2, a useful consideration of the vocabulary and style of *GHS*; 3, the parallel passages of *GHS* and *Knyttlingasaga*; 4, an alphabetical list of geographical names.

L. M. HOLLANDER.

Madison, Wis.